

PAUL LAVERDURE

## THE FIRST VICE-PROVINCE OF TORONTO, 1898-1901

### SUMMARY

*The Decline of the Canadian Missions; American and Belgian Redemptorist Rivalry in Canada; The Vice-province of Canada, 1893; The Creation of the Vice-province of Toronto, 1898; The Collapse of the Vice-province of Toronto; Conclusion.*

In 1898, a Vice-province of Toronto was erected by the new Superior General, Father Matthias Raus. It comprised the Baltimore Province's Canadian foundations of Toronto, Quebec City, and Saint John; its American foundations of Rochester and Buffalo, both in New York; and the St. Louis Province foundations of Detroit and Grand Rapids, both in Michigan. The Vice-province was suppressed in 1901. Father Michael Curley, the official historian for the Baltimore Province, described the reorganization of the Canadian houses as less than popular, an annoyance, artificial, and an administrative fizzle. He placed the blame on a hasty plan cooked up and secretly rammed through by the Consultor General for North America, Joseph Schwarz. Curley's successor, Father Alfred Rush, also dismissed the incident in a single page. The chronicler for the St. Louis Province, Father Peter Geiermann, included the houses of Detroit and Grand Rapids for the years 1898 to 1901 in his account as if they had never been anything but part of the St. Louis Province. Most Redemptorists, however, preferred Father John Byrne's history of the Redemptorists in North America which said nothing about the episode<sup>1</sup>. The history is worth telling, be-

---

<sup>1</sup> MICHAEL CURLEY, C.Ss.R., *The Provincial Story. A History of the Baltimore Province of the Congregation of the Most Holy Redeemer* (New York 1963) 232, 238-9; ALFRED RUSH, C.Ss.R., «The Vice Province that Didn't», in «*The Province Story*» (A Redemptorist Historical Review - Baltimore Province) 6 (1983) 24. JOHN F. BYRNE, C.Ss.R., *The Redemptorist*

cause it reveals how competing American, European, and French Canadian imperialisms shaped the Redemptorists of English Canada.

### THE DECLINE OF THE CANADIAN MISSIONS

Outside of the prosperous Redemptorist parish foundations in Canada lay the hardships of the Canadian missions. «[T]he work is harder than elsewhere», one of the American missionaries explained, «not only because of the incomprehensible ignorance of the majority, but because of the incessant preaching, the rough travelling, the poor diet, & the miserable lodgings».

[O]n one occasion, after closing a mission I had to drive 21 miles in a heavy rainstorm, put up for the night, & next morning drive 18 miles again in a blinding snowstorm. Then, too, not infrequently but one of us can give the mission & then imagine how pleasant it is to say mass everyday at 9 1/2 or 10 a.m., preach for an hour after it, bless articles of devotion, settle little difficulties, & drive a few miles before getting a bite to eat, hurry back again ... hear confessions until service-time, then give a short instruction, say the beads, preach an hour's sermon, and sing the Benediction, - bless articles & go back to the confessional to remain till 8 or 9 o'clock at times before getting a supper. At the same time, we have to be carpenters, painters, locksmiths, & tailors, we have to make the cross & paint it, make grates for hearing confessions, & put up a store for the mission-goods<sup>2</sup>.

Most of the missionaries tried to keep up a regular life of prayer when on the road; others simply gave up trying<sup>3</sup>.

---

*Centenaries* (Philadelphia 1932); *Catalogue of the Members of the Toronto Province of the Congregation of the Most Holy Redeemer* (February 1991) 40.

<sup>2</sup> Redemptorist Archives of the Baltimore Province [RABP], Section: 325 (Schauer), document: 1885 November 25, P[eter] Trimpel, C.Ss.R., at Cumberland County, Nova Scotia, to Schauer. The Belgians also suffered the same: Redemptorist Archive of the North Bruxelles Province [RANBP], Section: (Biographia), File: «Catulle, Jan» Section: «Briefwisseling met burggravin M. Vilain XIII», document: 14 July 1884, New York, Catulle to [Mademoiselle la Vicomtest Mathilde Vilain XIII] «Je ne vous cacherai pas qu'à la vue des rudes travaux que nos Pères d'amérique doivent soutenir, au milieu d'une population assez malpropre et dans un climat où l'on passe du froid le plus intense à la chaleur la plus accablante, mon courage faiblit, et j'ai besoin d'appeler Jésus et Marie au secours pour dire du fond du cœur Fiat».

<sup>3</sup> See RABP 528 (Rochester) 1879 May 12, Frederic [Brandstaetter], C.Ss.R., in Ste Adelaide de Pabos, Gaspé County, Canada, to [Schauer?]; The Belgian Provincial protested

The small parishes, the frontier nature of rural Canadian Catholicism, and the difficulties in travel and in scheduling missions around the farming seasons, changed the Redemptorist mission. In spite of tradition and training, the typical Canadian parish mission given by American and Belgian Redemptorists declined from one month to eight days by the end of the nineteenth century. «Baby» missions were held in five days<sup>4</sup>. Instead of using a large team of Redemptorist missionary preachers and confessors for the small parishes, mission house superiors instituted solo and two-man mission teams.

Redemptorist missionaries were sometimes forced to call on neighboring parish priests to supply extra confessors. This destroyed two reasons for a Redemptorist mission: to offer penitents the chance to experience God's forgiveness in a new way, according to the moral theology promoted by the Redemptorists and the chance to seek divine forgiveness without having to face and be recognized by an all-too human old acquaintance. With fewer preachers on a mission, there were fewer good preachers, fewer ways to present the doctrines of the Church, and fewer chances to move the hearts of the diverse hearers<sup>5</sup>.

Redemptorists in Canada also postponed the second part or the renewal of the mission. Alphonsus Liguori recommended the renewal six months after the mission to strengthen the missions' teachings and to emphasize God's mercy and love. By the end of

---

the routine statistics in: Archives of the Redemptorist Province of Toronto [ARPT] file: (Pl.RR.PP. Provincialis et Visitoris permanentis. Documenta) [Letters from the Belgian Provincial and the Canadian Visitor to St. Ann's, Montreal, 1885-1912], document: 1897 October 2.

<sup>4</sup> RABP 325 (Schauer) 1884 January 23, F.X. Miller, C.Ss.R., in Thorold, Ontario, to Schauer; Wissel's opposition to the shortening of the missions can be seen in 1882 May 24, to Schauer about the Halifax mission; ARPT (Administratio C.Ss.R. Domus ad S. Annam) 1891 «Recès de la visite canonique» insisted that the missions be prolonged to twelve days, as in Europe. The Belgians of St. Ann, Montreal gave over forty missions a year late in the century, but the number of days in each missione decreased; ARPT «St. Ann's, Montreal - Chronicum ministerii externi»; RANBP «Laborum Apostolicorum extra domum». In 1884, the American missionaries gave a 'large' mission in St. Patrick's, Ottawa — ten days for the men and ten days for the women — which would have been considered a normal mission just ten years previously and a small one in Europe.

<sup>5</sup> RABP 325 (Schauer) Boston, 1884 September 25, Charles Rathke, C.Ss.R., to Schauer. Solo and two-man mission teams in Canada began soon after the establishment of the Redemptorists in Quebec City in 1874 and were common practice throughout the 1880s; see RABP 595.5 (Toronto, St. Patrick), 1889 October 15, Joseph Henning, C.Ss.R., to Schauer, and annual mission reports both in the house chronicles and in the foundation files; RABP 325 (Schauer) «Provincial Regulations for Missions» [1884] by Schauer against the practice of solo preachers.

the nineteenth century, distant Canadian parishes saw the renewal only a year later if at all. Some parish priests, in fact, preferred the renewal to take place in only one year's time, so that the parish priest could take an annual vacation. Thus the mission that most people may have experienced became a truncated, harsh experience, remembered for the terrifying sermons on Sin, Death, Judgement, and Hell. The Belgian Superiors rightly saw that Canada had been saturated with too many short-term missions and proposed giving only longer missions<sup>6</sup>.

Since the Redemptorists had visited most if not all of the parishes of English Canada, the novelty and the popularity of the Redemptorist mission declined in Canada as in the rest of the English-speaking world, not because of failure ironically but because of success<sup>7</sup>. By the end of the nineteenth century, most of the parishes of Canada had experienced a Redemptorist-style mission; most of the religious communities had had Redemptorists as retreat masters or as confessors; most parishioners used the confessional. Between 1876 and 1894, the population of all of Canada was under five million people. At the end of the century, Canadian Catholics constituted under two million people. Roughly four-fifths were French Canadians. Besides the growing rivalry between the American and the Belgian Redemptorists for the few English Canadian missions available, other congregations such as the Oblates of Mary Immaculate and the Jesuits also competed for the same parish missions<sup>8</sup>. Redemptorists had obviously saturated the small English Canadian mission field. Until a new generation of English Canadian Catholics in need of renewal came forward, the

---

<sup>6</sup> Archives of the Redemptorist General Government, Rome [AGR], section: Belgium, file: (Visitatio), document: 1892 September 25, «Rapport sur la Province Belge en 1892». Also RANBP (Montreal) 1894 December 16, Catulle to Van Aertselaer.

<sup>7</sup> JOHN SHARP, *Reapers of the Harvest. The Redemptorists in Great Britain and Ireland 1843-1898* (Dublin 1989) 230. Also RANBP (Biographia) «Godts, Willem» [c1894] July 17, G[uillaume] Godts, C.Ss.R., to his brother François[-Xavier] Godts, C.Ss.R., that missions are rare, because there is competition from other religious congregations; the malaise on the missions reached Rome in AGR Belgium (Visitatio) «Rapport sur la Province Belge en 1892» by Ernest Buboïs, who wrote that the Redemptorists were well-respected by the people and the bishops, but the missions were too frequent.

<sup>8</sup> While the Redemptorists went to Newfoundland, the Jesuits were able to give missions in Peterborough; RABP 325 (Schauer) 1882 February 6, F.X. Miller, C.Ss.R., to Schauer; the same Redemptorist later found it deeply consoling to be giving a mission in Penetanguishene to abandoned Natives near where the Jesuits had been martyred; 1883 April 25, Miller to Schauer.

Redemptorist parish mission as practised in North America since 1832 slowed to a stop.

#### AMERICAN AND BELGIAN REDEMPTORIST RIVALRY IN CANADA

The Congregation had established four English houses in Canada by 1897. The Baltimore Province of the Eastern United States controlled three: St. Patrick's church in Quebec City, St. Patrick's parish in Toronto, and St. Peter's parish in Saint John, New Brunswick. The Belgian Province staffed the fourth English house, St. Ann's parish in Montreal, as well as the famous pilgrimage site of St. Anne-de-Beaupré which attracted both English and French speaking pilgrims from Canada and the United States.

Due to the decline of the Canadian missions and growing responsibilities in the United States, the American Redemptorists were content to see their Canadian houses as mere extensions of the Baltimore Province. The parishes, with its buildings and its societies became the main focus of the American Redemptorists in Canada. The Canadian houses differed from each other only in that St. Patrick's parish, Toronto and St. Patrick's parish, Quebec City were known as English language or, rather, Irish foundations, while St. Peter's parish in New Brunswick was often staffed with German-American priests. The Irish in Saint John, New Brunswick were not threatened by an overwhelming French majority as in Quebec or a Protestant one as in Toronto and were therefore perhaps less insistent on having priests exactly like themselves. In everything, architecture, decorations, and parish organization, the houses became indistinguishable from any of the other American houses. English speaking Catholics up to the First World War, usually recent immigrants, identified more strongly with other parts of the British Empire, or even with the United States, than with Canada and the French speaking Canadians<sup>9</sup>. There was little difference between an Irish immigrant to a Redemptorist parish in the United States and one that arrived in a Redemptorist parish in Canada. So, year after year, American Redemptorist

---

<sup>9</sup> For Irish population statistics of Saint John, PETER M. TONER, «*Another 'New Ireland' Lost: The Irish of New Brunswick*», in ROBERT O'DRISCOLL and LORNA REYNOLDS, ed., *The Untold Story: The Irish in Canada* 2 volumes (Toronto 1988) I: 231-5, 232.

missionaries, fathers and brothers came and went, treating Canadians as if they were Americans.

Expecting the Belgians to expand and needing his men in the United States, Father Provincial Schauer gradually withdrew the American missionaries from Canada. Many Americans disliked the cold, sparsely populated wastes of Canada, the lack of missions, the different flag, government, and customs, and begged to return to the United States<sup>10</sup>. Schauer planned that, with the Belgians so near to Quebec City in Ste-Anne-de-Beaupré, the Americans could abandon Quebec City. St. Patrick had never succeeded as a mission house in French Canada. Moreover, the growth of the railways and other Canadian ports, especially Montreal, and the decline of the shipping industry around Quebec City brought the parish of St. Patrick in Quebec City to shrink by half, from fifteen thousand to just over seventy-five hundred by the end of the century<sup>11</sup>. Schauer was also prepared to turn over Toronto and Saint John to the Belgian-Canadian Redemptorists whenever the Belgians were ready. By 1894, therefore, all of the American foundations in Canada were no longer mission houses but parishes. All were run by older, semi-retired American Redemptorists. English language missions were given from the Redemptorist houses in the United States<sup>12</sup>. Quiet regular order reigned over the American houses in Canada.

Between 1881 and 1896 the Belgians received forty-seven novices, mainly French Canadian. To overcome the administrative distances between Belgium and Canada, Father General Mauron considered founding a separate Canadian Redemptorist province

---

<sup>10</sup> RABP 595.5 (Toronto, St. Patrick) 1886 December 29, F.X. Miller to Schauer; RABP 325 (Schauer) 1887 April 18, Burke to Schauer; RABP (personnel) «Burke, Michael S.», 1887 June 16, Burke to Schauer.

<sup>11</sup> MONIQUE RIVET, «Les Irlandais à Québec 1870-1968» (M.A. Laval University 1969) 64.

<sup>12</sup> RABP 595.5 (Toronto, St. Patrick) 1888 August 27, Joseph Henning, C.Ss.R., to Schauer, re the decision to suppress Toronto as a mission house; «1897 - House of Toronto - Report» p. 2, «...there is not one real healthy man in the seven»; RABP 595.4 (St. John, N.B., St. Peter) 1891 March 17, John Hayden, C.Ss.R., to Father Procurator, Joseph Wuest, C.Ss.R., that the debt on the Saint John house could not be paid because the Provincial had removed the missionaries and the Bishop had suppressed the Purgatorian Society; «Recessus Visitationis Canonica habitae in Collegio ad St. Petri in St. John N.B. a die 3 usque ad diem Sam Martii 1892»; Annals of St. Peter's, Saint John, N.B.; for evidence of St. Peter's German character, see RABP 595.4 (St. John, N.B., St. Peter) and RABP 245 (Chronicles) «Chronica Provincia Baltimorensis anno 1897»; Perpetual Help, Brooklyn, New York, gave ten missions, three renewals, and two spiritual exercises in Canada and thirty-four other exercises in the United States.

as early as 1884. With St. Anne-de-Beaupré sending missionaries further and further afield in search of missions throughout Quebec, New Brunswick, Maine, or wherever there were French Canadians, and with St. Ann's parish in Montreal giving missions in whatever English parish the American Redemptorists or the other congregations overlooked, the Belgian Redemptorists saw no need to expand into the American foundations in Canada or to found any new Canadian houses. There were too few missions to warrant establishing a separate provincial administration in Canada<sup>13</sup>.

Although the Americans had demonstrated that parishes were part of North American Catholicism and that they could become perpetual Redemptorist missions fruitful in young vocations, the Belgians never considered expanding into Canadian parishes. Having left home, country, and continent to go on the missions, few Belgians wanted to work in parishes. Living mainly in French Canada, few Belgians actually learned English, so English-language parish foundations were regularly refused both for lack of qualified men as well as for lack of interest<sup>14</sup>. The Redemptorist Rule, written in a parish-rich Neapolitan context, also forbade parishes in order to keep good missionaries on the missions. So, in 1892 the Belgian Provincial Ernest Dubois diagnosed the decline in the American missions in Canada as the result of the parishes using up good missionaries<sup>15</sup>. Since the Belgians had only two parishes in Canada, the causes for the decline in the Belgian missions were obviously elsewhere, as in the length of the mission, the number of men preaching the mission, or the practice of inviting secular clergy as confessors. Nonetheless, Provincial Dubois repeated to Father General Mauron that Belgians were missionaries, not parish priests.

The rivalry between the American and the Belgian missionaries on the shrinking mission field came to symbolize more than the missions themselves. At stake for the Americans was the principle of parishes as an authentic Redemptorist apostolate. The Americans believed parishes could be perpetual missions, centres where missionaries could rest or work when not on the mis-

---

<sup>13</sup> AGR Belgium (Visitatio) «Rapport sur la Province Belge en 1892».

<sup>14</sup> AGR Belgium (Provincialia) 1885 November 3, Kockerols to Mauron, Ottawa to be refused for lack of English speaking Belgians; also 1888 December 11, Mauron to Kockerols.

<sup>15</sup> AGR Belgium (Visitatio) «Rapport sur la Province Belge en 1892».

sions, and excellent sources of young men sure in their Redemptorist vocation for having lived with Redemptorists in the parish. The Belgians, relying on the Rule, refused parishes and insisted on the European model of isolated mission houses without the care of parishioners. In frustration at the competition, some of the Belgians criticized the Americans as mere secular clergy, an insult among religious who saw themselves as superior to secular parish priests. The Belgians backed up the insult by stating that Redemptorist missionaries were not supposed to eat meat three times a day and were not supposed to smoke or drink, all of which American Redemptorists were seen to do in Canada. The complaints were sent to Rome and made their way back to North America, souring relations between the Belgians and the Americans even further<sup>16</sup>. The Americans never forgave the Belgians for throwing doubt on the Americans' loyalty to the Rule and to the traditions of the Redemptorist mission, especially since the Americans had opened the Canadian field to the Belgians. The rivalry became so fierce that rumours circulated freely about which province would win the Canadian field<sup>17</sup>.

Since the monasteries in Belgium were full, causing the Belgians to become the great Redemptorist foreign missionaries of the nineteenth century, they were less than eager for Canadian vocations and screened them strictly, almost harshly, on two counts: education and nationalism. First, Belgians declared Canadian education to be inferior by European standards. If one looked at

---

<sup>16</sup> RANBP (Biographia) «Catulle, Jan» [1884] July 13, Catulle to «Rev. Mother» stating that American Fathers are all in parishes which harm the missionary work and interior life. He hopes Belgians are never afflicted with parochial work; AGR Belgium (Vice-provincia Canadensis) 1885 March 11, Catulle to Kockerols; also 1893 January 19, Dubois to Mauron «... les Pères de la province de Baltimore ont peu de sympathie pour leurs confrères belges au Canada; ils semblent les considérer comme observant la Règle trop à la lettre, et comme censeurs de leur conduite plus large»; Charles Debongnie, Rector of Beaupré also wrote how «Les Belg. ne veulent pas de l'observance américains»; the history of this rivalry can be seen in 1887 September 24, Debongnies to Kockerols; RANBP (Brandon) «Brief von ... Kockerols» 1988 December 20, Archbishp Thomas Duhamel of Ottawa to Kockerols; AGR Belgium (Provincialia) 1897 April 16, Van Aertselaer to Raus; RABP 325 (Schauer) 1883 October 11, Charles currier, C.Ss.R., to Schauer.

<sup>17</sup> AGR Belgium (Vice-provincia Canadensis) 1892 January 9, Catulle to Mauron, complaining about delays; 1893 January 19, Tielen to [Dubois?] about rumours among the Belgians; AGR Belgium (Provincialia) 1893 February 27 [?], Ulrich to [Provincial] Dubois about the tumours amongst the Americans; 1893 March 1, Dubois to [Ulrich?] about the consultations between the Baltimore and Belgian provinces and the hope that relations would improve.

the private Catholic schools of Belgium or the Belgian government-sponsored schools and compared them to the poverty-stricken parish schools and classical colleges beginning to make their appearance amongst Canadian Catholics, the Belgians had a point. As for the English Canadians, the Belgians noted that public schools in Ontario were sound in mathematics, but sorely deficient in the humanities, French and Latin. Second, Belgians noted that French Canadians were nationalistic, emotionally attached to their country and hardly tolerated any criticisms of it. The Belgians saw how French Canadians looked down on the Irish as recent arrivals who had more in common with the English Protestants than with the French Catholics. Many of the Irish, absorbing the attitudes of other British immigrants to Canada, simply despised the French as a conquered, backward people. The Belgian superiors forbade all discussions of nationality. To solve these two problems, too little education and too much nationalism, the Belgians insisted that all Canadian candidates, French and English, study in Belgium<sup>18</sup>. This solution would give the Canadians both education and exposure to the universal church which was supposed to be above nation or state.

Unfortunately, few young vocations survived the challenge to give up language, family, and country. Many first generation vocations therefore came from the ranks of the diocesan priesthood or from the classical colleges. The ones who persevered in their Redemptorist vocation were already old enough to withstand or wel-

---

<sup>18</sup> AGR Belgium (Vice-provincia Canadensis) 1896 «Projet d'un petit Juvenat dans la Vice province du Canada» states: «Le canadien est très attaché à son pays, il en est enthousiaste et supporte d'autant moins la comparaison avec d'autre pays que son infériorité est plus réelle»; ARPT (Pl.RR.PP. Provincialis et Visitatoris permanentis. Documenta) 1891 May 25; (Administratio C.Ss.R. Domus ad S. Annam) «Recés de la visite canonique» 1891, the Visitor insisted on the need for English speakers but could not normally accept them after the age of seventeen if they knew no Latin or French; RANBP (Montreal) 1897 October 30, Van Aertselae to Jean-Baptiste Hoyois, C.Ss.R., «Comme le caractère irlandais est moins bon que le caractère canadien on devra avoir soin que les canadiens dominent toujours par le nombre»; AGR Belgium (Visitatio) «Rapport sur la Province Belge en 1892» by Dubois, stating that English is essential in Canada, but if an English or Irish candidate has neither French nor Latin, he should be sent to the St. Louis Province; as for the French Canadiens, he recommends sending them to Belgium to test their vocation and to break their ties to country, home and family; (Vice-provincia Canadensis) 1892 September 5, Catulle to Mauron, «Il me semble que nous avons déjà un nombre suffisant de Canadiens-français»; 1894 November 19-23 «Rapport de la Visite Canonique faite à la maison de Ste Anne de Beaupré... par le R.P. Jean Catulle, C.Ss.R.» details some of the antipathies between the Irish and the French.

come the shock of going overseas for training in the asceticism of the novitiate and the moral theology of St. Alphonsus<sup>19</sup>.

Even when the Canadians arrived in Belgium, there were other problems. It may be amusing today to consider how central heating could make or break a priestly vocation, but in 1897 a Canadian was totally unprepared for the lack of central heating in the Belgian houses and ran a severe health risk<sup>20</sup>. The Belgians could not understand how Canadians, after surviving the Canadian winter, could suffer in Belgium. Of those who persevered and pronounced the vows of religion, more than one suffered an early death. The French Canadian Alfred Pampalon died of tuberculosis at the age of twenty-nine. The English Canadian Francis Scanlan of Montreal joined the Belgians soon after they took over St. Ann's parish. Described as robust by the Belgians, he suffered constantly in Belgium. Although Scanlan worked in St. Ann, Montreal in less demanding parish societies after his ordination in 1896, in 1900 his health deteriorated even further. He was transferred to the easier work of editing the English Annals of St. Anne-de-Beaupré until his early death at the age of thirty-four in 1902. He had left Montreal for Belgium in perfect health and he returned a sick man. His example, of course, further discouraged vocations from the parish<sup>21</sup>. Young men sent back to Canada as unprepared, unsuitable, or broken in health, cooled other vocations and, of course, prejudiced parents of several other young men against the Redemptorists.

When the Belgians further complained about the lack of good vocations, the French Canadians countered that the Belgians in

---

<sup>19</sup> The following Canadiens all worked in St. Ann, Montreal, in the nineteenth century: Adelard Barolet, professed fourteen years after ordination in Canada; Arthur Caron, professed after seven years of ordination; Pierre Girard, professed after eighteen years; Edward Lamontage, professed after eleven years; Clement Leclerc, professed after two years; Alphonse Lemieux, professed after six years; and Louis Savard, professed six years. Other men who persevered were Edmund Flynn, Louis Fortier, Daniel Holland, René Lava, John McPhail, Paul Rioux, and Alfred Trudel, all of them in their twenties before going to Belgium. The exception was George Daly vested at the age of sixteen.

<sup>20</sup> AGR Belgium (Novitiatu Canada) 1903 January 26, Hon[oré] De Nys, C.Ss.R., to Father Visitor [Alphonse Lemieux].

<sup>21</sup> PIERRE PAMPALON, C.Ss.R., *Une fleur canadienne dans l'institut de Saint-Alphonse, un notice biographique du Serviteur de Dieu, le R.P. Alfred Pampalon* (Montreal 1902); RANBP (Rapports du Studendat Beauplateau - Leuven) «Catalogus Oblatorum Clericorum I», n° 475; born August 8, 1867 in Montreal, professed in 1887, ordained in 1896 and died on the operating table in 1902 at the age of thirty-four; see also (Biographia) «Scanlan, Francis» especially «Necrologium R.P. Francisci Scanlan, C.Ss.R.».

Canada were not always perfect themselves. Besides the fact that some Belgians were sent to Canada because they had become undesirable in Europe and were equally undesirable in Canada, others were arrogant in their assumption of European superiority and French Canadian inferiority, while still others were not spared the nineteenth century's legacy of nationalism: Flemish versus Walloon<sup>22</sup>. The Flemish and the Walloon Belgian Redemptorists eventually split the Belgian Province in 1961 into a North Brussels Province for the Flemish and the South Brussels Province for the Walloons. The French Canadians pointed out that the Belgians had been in Canada since 1878 and nothing had been done to anchor the Redemptorists permanently in Canada with native vocations. No novitiate, no minor seminary, and certainly no major seminary had been established to encourage vocations to the point where they could survive transplanting to Belgium. After spending huge amounts of money in Beaupré and in St. Ann, Montreal, the Belgians were then content to tax the Canadian houses of any surplus revenues for Belgium's projects elsewhere. The Belgians declared that any money made on the Canadian missions would not stay in Canada to pay for education there but would go to Belgium to pay for the Canadian students studying there. Furthermore, the Belgians declared that no expansion into the American foundations would be allowed until the French Canadian houses were full, yet Canadian vocations would be sent to the Antilles, if they did not remain in Belgium. French Canadians naturally complained about the treatment shown to Canada by the Belgian Redemptorists<sup>23</sup>.

---

<sup>22</sup> RANBP (Biographia) «Godts, Willem», 1883 January 19, Guillaume Godts, C.Ss.R., to his brother F.-X. Godts, C.Ss.R., claiming Canadians are, in that word later made famous by a Canadian Prime Minister, «pleutres». While the poor had true faith, the rest were not worth «la bille au cul»; AGR Belgium (Provincialia) 1886 November 22, Kockerols to Mauron about an individual Redemptorist to be sent to Canada; AGR Belgium (Vice-provincia Canadensis) 1890 February 10, Catulle to Mauron, «Le peuple Canadien est entiché de son pays et de sa nationalité. ... Nos Pères Canadiens sont fort zélés, mais ils n'ont pas pour la Congrégation; cet amour vivace & généreux des Pères Belges. Pour nous Belges, notre loi est: Dieu et la Congrégation. Il n'en est pas de même des Canadiens.

<sup>23</sup> AGR Belgium (Provincialia) 1896 May 16, Aertselaer to Dubois; for the Antilles, RANBP (Montreal) «Notes Sur l'établissement des Rédemptoristes Belges au CANADA» (n.a., n.d., c. 1901?); ARPT (Pl.RR.PP. Provincialis et Visitatoris permanentis. Documenta) 1892 October 32, French Canadian fathers were to be sent to England for language study; AGR Belgium (Vice-provincia Canadensis) 1897 October 2, [Clément] Leclerc, C.Ss.R., to Raus «... il existe un grand malaise entre les deux éléments canadien et belge. Le canadiens en gémissent. ... A leur yeux, nous [canadiens] ne sommes qu'un troupeau d'ignorants, d'apathiques, difficile à gouverner».

English Canadians hesitated to undergo Belgian training. It seemed easier to join other religious congregations or the American provinces where fluent French, excellent Latin, a long sea voyage, meagre meals, and unheated houses were not prerequisites for entry. Records show that prior to 1898 at least fifty Canadian-born English speaking candidates to the priesthood, most of them trained in American Redemptorist minor seminaries, and ten candidates to the brotherhood presented themselves to the novitiates of the American provinces. Many of these candidates came from the American foundations of Toronto, Quebec, and Saint John, but a dozen Montreal English Catholics also went to the Baltimore and the St. Louis provinces rather than to the Belgian province which held St. Ann's parish in Montreal<sup>24</sup>.

Before 1898 only three English Canadians, Francis Scanlan, John McPhail, and Daniel Holland, were ordained in the Belgium Province. Significantly, neither McPhail nor Holland were from the parish of St. Ann. Evidence suggests that both were attracted to the Redemptorists after attending missions preached by Americans.

John McPhail was born in Kingston in 1864. Teaching school there and thinking about the priesthood, visiting Redemptorist missionaries caught his attention. In spite of his age he was accepted because of his excellent Latin. He left for Belgium in 1889 at the age of twenty-five and was ordained in 1893. The Belgians categorized him as a typically cold, stiff Scot more interested in reading the works of the English Cardinals Henry Edward Manning or John Henry Newman and improving his English oratory than in learning more French. Several times on the verge of being dismissed for poor marks -- several of his classes were in French -- and for his lack of personal warmth, he was passed on the strength of his unshakeable virtue. He was declared unfit for Belgium but acceptable possibly in America. He went on to an extraordinary missionary preaching career in three languages, English, French, and Gaelic, throughout Canada and the United States until his death in 1932<sup>25</sup>.

---

<sup>24</sup> ARPT 210, 1943 November 25, Edward Molloy, C.Ss.R., of the St. Louis Province, to George Daly, C.Ss.R., describing why he and others left Montreal in 1898 for the St. Louis Province.

<sup>25</sup> RANBP (Noviciat Choristen) 1889 June 24, Catulle to Kockerols; (Rapports du Studendat Beauplateau - Leuven) «Catalogus Oblatorum Clericorum I» n° 507; AGR Belgium (Studendatus) «Rapport sur le Studendat de Beauplateau. Année scolaire 1893-

Daniel Holland was born in 1858 in Placentia Bay, Newfoundland. Older even than McPhail, he left Newfoundland in 1889 for Montreal at the age of thirty-one. Although Rector Jean Catulle suggested he join as a lay brother, Holland insisted on going for ordination and left for Belgium immediately. Belgian Redemptorists doubted he had any priestly vocation and declared that, although he seemed intelligent enough to learn Latin, «he is Irish, and a *character to excess*, so much so that one may ask whether he has any judgement». Big, bluff, loud, and musical, all of which was frowned upon in crowded monasteries dedicated to silence, the Belgians delayed his profession until he had completed some make-up education and proven that he could succeed at his theological studies. Although his lack of French also hampered his studies, his goodness, his prior experience as a store clerk which gave him a large fund of common sense and knowledge and, above all, his excellent health and physical strength recommended him for the missionary life. He was ordained in 1895 and spent the early part of his Redemptorist life on missions in the Antilles and then in Canada until his health failed. He then worked in the Montreal and Quebec City parishes until his death at the age of sixty-three in 1922<sup>26</sup>.

Two other Montreal Catholics, George Daly and Edmund Flynn, are often thought to be English Canadian Redemptorists, but they grew up speaking French because their mothers were French Canadians. The Belgians did not consider them English until Daly and Flynn's limited knowledge of English made them valuable in the parish of St. Ann. When it came time to choose between an English or a French Province, Edmund Flynn chose to work in French. Only in 1900 did Daly return to Canada from Belgium where he had been since 1887; he had no part to play in the Vice-province of Toronto. In 1897, therefore, after twenty years of work in Canada, the Belgians had only three ordained English speaking Canadians.

---

1894» «il a encore trop l'esprit écossais et américaine, et il s'habitua mieux en Amérique qu'en Belgique»; for McPhail's early missions, see RANBP (Montreal) «Chronica Ministerri Externi pro Anno Domini» 1902 and following.

<sup>26</sup> RANBP (Noviciaat Choristen) 1889 March 29, Kockerols to Novice Master, quoting Debongnie; (Rapports du Studendat Beauplateau - Leuven) «Catalogus Oblatorum Clericorum I», n° 516; AGR Belgium (Studendatus) «Rapports sur le Studendat de Beauplateau. Année scolaire 1893-1894».

Complaints from Canada flowed to Rome as English Canadian candidates continued to leave Canada for the American provinces and as French Canadian candidates for Belgium were being turned away, discouraged or, worse, were being accepted to ruin their health in the unheated houses of Belgium or to be sent to other mission fields far from Canada.

#### THE VICE-PROVINCE OF CANADA, 1893

To stop the rivalry between the Americans and the Belgians, to reverse the decline in the Canadian missions and to increase Canadian vocations, Father General Mauron decided to grant the mission field to the Belgians. In 1893 he set up the Belgian Vice-province of Canada, which included the two Belgian houses of Canada and the Belgian Redemptorist houses in the West Indies. He established the vice-provincial headquarters in St. Ann, Montreal intending it to become the centre of a bilingual Redemptorist Province for all of Canada<sup>27</sup>. As for the «American settlements in Canada», Mauron wrote to the Baltimore Provincial, «a decision will be made later whether and how and which one of them can be transferred to the Belgian province»<sup>28</sup>. Mauron then named the most active critic of the American parish and the most active proponent of Belgian expansion into English Canada, Jean Catulle, to head the Vice-province of Canada. Rome had spoken and it seemed that the Redemptorists would live in English Canada according to the Belgian model of Redemptorist life and missions. Catulle insisted that Belgium immediately take over the other English houses of Canada. The Belgian Redemptorists, he said, absolutely needed English, English houses, and English vocations to succeed on the English Canadian missions. Many of the Belgians who worked in Montreal at St. Ann's church believed that the future of the Redemptorists in Canada lay in becoming English<sup>29</sup>. This English policy further alienated the French Canadians. As one stated:

---

<sup>27</sup> AGR Belgium (Vice-provincia Canadensis) 1893 April 26, Mauron circular; Catulle was named visitor and procurator.

<sup>28</sup> RABP 326 (Litw) 1893 April 26, Mauron to Ferdinand Litz.

<sup>29</sup> Catulle and Strubbe, for example; ARPT «St. Ann's Young Men's Society» Scrapbook, 1897, on the fiftieth anniversary of the 1847 immigration.

The Belgians do not want French Canadians who want to join, but they want the Irish who do not want to join and who go to the Baltimore Province. ... French Canadians form four-fifths of the Catholics in the country and the three houses the Baltimore Province has in Canada could easily suffice for the English language Catholics<sup>30</sup>.

Although the Americans had demonstrated that vocations came from parishes, both French Canadians and Belgians at least agreed that few parish foundations were needed in sparsely-populated Canada.

Given American Provincial Schauer's prior plans to close or withdraw from the Baltimore Province foundations in Canada, Catulle naturally assumed that Baltimore still would willingly withdraw from Toronto, Quebec City, and Saint John, New Brunswick as they had long said they would<sup>31</sup>. Catulle proposed to begin by taking over the house in Quebec City to turn it into a foundation similar to St. Ann, Montreal where the community spoke French inside the monastery but English inside the church. If the English parish died, as the Americans had often predicted, then the Belgian and Canadian Redemptorists could easily switch to French in the church or turn it into a mission church with no parish responsibilities<sup>32</sup>. In the best of all possible worlds, the Belgians would spread into English Canada with Flemish Belgians and Irish Canadians while growing in Quebec with French Canadians and Walloon Belgians. Unfortunately for Catulle, Father General Mauron never followed through with a decision about the American houses. He died in July of 1893 shortly after establishing the Vice-province. Schauer was no longer provincial.

---

<sup>30</sup> AGR Belgium (*Vice-provincia Canadensis*) 1897 November 14, Adalbert Guillot, C.Ss.R., to [?] «On ne veut pas des Canadiens qui voudraient de nous et on veut des Irlandais qui ne veulent pas de nous et vont à la province de Baltimore. ... Mais si la Vice-Province n'est pas pour les deux millions de Canadiens-Français, elle n'a plus sa raison d'être. Ceux-ci forment les quatre cinquième des catholique dans le pays et les trois maisons, que la province de Baltimore possède au Canada, peuvent bien suffire aux catholiques de langue anglaise».

<sup>31</sup> RANBP (Montreal) 1894 December 16, 1895 August 13, Catulle to Van Aertselaer.; his sentiments about the future of the Redemptorists in English Canada were echoed by another Belgian, Joseph Billiau, see AGR Belgium (*Vice-provincia Canadensis*) 1897 May 29, Billiau to Consultor General John Magnier.

<sup>32</sup> AGR Belgium (*Vice-provincia Canadensis*) 1895 July 10, Catulle to Consultor Heneral [Ernest Dubois] describing how St. Patrick, Quebec City, is melting away, «se fond tout doucement», as Irish families leave and are never replaced.

Forgotten were the old agreements between Baltimore, Belgium, and Father General Mauron to turn over the American houses in Canada to the Belgians<sup>33</sup>.

Baltimore refused to give up St. Patrick's parish in Quebec City. To justify this refusal, the Americans pointed out that the Belgians had few English speaking fathers. There were not enough English Canadians amongst the Belgians to replace even the few, semi-retired Americans the parish foundations employed. When bilingual French Canadians who had studied in England or had worked in the Antilles were found, the Americans insisted that the parishioners would revolt under French Canadian priests. The Irish parishioners of St. Patrick wanted only Irish priests, which only the Americans could provide. The Belgians working in St. Ann, Montreal thought otherwise. Irish parishioners did accept other priests if the priests were totally dedicated to the parishioners and did not cause rivalries by splitting their attention between the French and the English or try to assimilate the English parishioners into the French majority<sup>34</sup>. The Americans wondered, as did some canonical visitors to Montreal, whether the Belgians ever spoke English well enough to be accepted by St. Ann's parishioners.

Why did the Americans refuse to leave a parish that had never lived up to missionary expectations, that had been visibly declining in population for years, and which they had been willing to let go a few years earlier? The Americans identified the parish as Redemptorist work. The Belgians did not. The Belgians in Canada were a direct threat to the American adaptation of the Redemptorist Rule on the North American continent. If the European authorities ever became convinced that the Belgians had successfully introduced the European model of Redemptorist life into North America, then the American Redemptorists could be asked to withdraw from most of their parishes. The Americans, relying on fifty years of failure with the European model and almost as many years of success with the North American parish model, refused to withdraw from their Canadian parishes.

<sup>33</sup> RANBP (Montreal) 1895 July 30, Raus to Van Aertselaer.

<sup>34</sup> AGR Baltimore (Provincialia) 1895 August 6, Litz to Schwarz; The Belgians were unprepared for much more English work, as their own canonical visitation showed: RANBP (Canada - Yorkton) 1894, «quod Hibernii cum suo pastore non bene consentiant» «... Anglice enim non bene loquitur»; RANBP (Montreal) 1895 JULY 25, Dubois to Van Aertselaer; AGR Belgium «Visitatio Canonica extraordinaria anno 1901» 31.

The American evidence is clear; since 1832, the German Americans had established on average one parish foundation every two and a half years. In twenty years the Belgians had founded only two houses in already established parishes, and one of those, Beaupré, a famous pilgrimage site. In 1897 the American Baltimore Province had over three hundred and twenty professed Redemptorists, not counting novices or students. Over half of the ordained men of the Baltimore Province were American born and even more of the men had been young children when they arrived and had been entirely educated in the United States, a sure sign of successful adaptation. The new Vice-province of Canada, although containing a high percentage of French Canadians, relied almost entirely on Belgians for its work in English Canada. In 1897, there were only twenty-six French Canadian Redemptorists, ten of them had been diocesan priests before going to Belgium for their novitiate, while over thirty-five Belgians worked in Canada<sup>35</sup>. The Americans had been in Canada only four years more than the Belgians and had received over sixty English Canadian novices from the Redemptorist parishes in Canada by 1898. The Belgians, however, refused to expand into the parishes and did not attract English vocations. What few vocations they attracted were treated very harshly since they really did not need vocations from Canada as long as Belgian vocations were plentiful. Canadian vocations, English and French, that persevered through the Belgian training were usually older, stronger, more mature men with an unshakeable commitment to the missions. American success, however, must be traced to the North American parish foundations.

Although the Belgians had attracted French Canadian vocations, which brought the Roman authorities to think that the future of the Congregation in Canada lay with the Belgians, their vocations generally came through the missions. French parishes were already well established and the Belgian Redemptorists were able

---

<sup>35</sup> RABP 245 (Chronicles) «Chronica Provinciae Baltimorensis anno 1897»; AGR Belgium (Vice-provincia Canadensis) 1890 February 10, Catulle to Mauron; *Digesta Chronica Collegiorum Congregationis SS. Redemptoris Provinciae Belgicae. Vice-provincia Canadiensis. I. Pulchrumptratrum and II. Marianopolis* (Lille, Paris, Bruges, Brussels 1894); The number of Belgians working in Canada at any time can be gleaned from Alphonse-Marie PARENT, C.Ss.R., «Membres de la Province de Ste-Anne depuis ses premiers débuts» (Ste-Anne de Beaupré, 26 juillet 1971), while Jean-Pierre ASSELIN, *Les Rédemptoristes au Canada. Implantation à Sainte-Anne-de-Beaupré 1878-1911* (Montréal 1981) 103-4 summarizes the French Canadian numbers.

to work very much as they had in Europe as a missionary auxiliary to the parish clergy. By restricting themselves to parish missions, when many North American parishes were not yet established, the Belgian Redemptorists could not expect to participate in the life of the Canadian church. Some parts of Europe had had parishes for a thousand years; parishes in Canada were few or in embryo and the itinerant Redemptorist parish missionaries had already visited almost all of them and many of them more than once. If the Redemptorists were to have a future in North America, the Americans realized, the parish itself had to become a perpetual mission and an example to surrounding areas. So, the European Redemptorist mission in rural areas became the Redemptorist American urban parish. Baltimore Provincial Litz wrote: «I know that though we are in far away America - we can compare favorably with those who are nearer the cradle of the Congregation . . . when it comes to *practising* the spirit of St. Alphonsus - we do as well as the '*preachers*'». <sup>36</sup> Although Americans saw Canada as a place of exile, the principle of parish foundations was at stake and with it the experience of the American Redemptorists since 1832<sup>37</sup>.

In summary, the Belgians had little experience of parishes, disliked Canadian nationalism, and discouraged Canadian candidates. Naturally, the result was that the Belgians had few English vocations and could not move beyond French Canada even if they would. The Americans could not believe that the Belgians would ever accept or adapt to the North American parish system and they feared that the Belgian model of Redemptorist life would be imposed and eventually destroy the Redemptorist Congregation in North America<sup>38</sup>. So, the American Redemptorists held on to St. Patrick's parish in Quebec City.

The Vice-province of Canada attempted to attract more young vocations. To overcome youthful and parental fears about the sea trip and the stay in Belgium, it established the first Canadian Redemptorist minor seminary in 1896. In two years twenty-one French and thirteen English students graduated, but a mere five

---

<sup>36</sup> RABP 326 (Litz) 1894 Easter [March 25], Rome, Litz to George Dusold.

<sup>37</sup> For example, RABP 595.5 (Toronto, St. Patrick) 1886 December 29, F.X. Miller to Schauer; also AGR Belgium (Vice-provincia Canadensis) 1891 May 21, Catulle to Mauron; RABP 326 (Litz) 1893 April 26, Mauron to Litz

<sup>38</sup> RABP 326 (Litz) 1896 May 21, Schwarz to Litz, that Rome believed the Americans to be overextended in parishes, which were against the Rule, but England, Ireland, and Australia were in favour of the American adaptations.

lasted the major seminary course in Belgium, only one of them English-speaking. The Belgians refused to allow a novitiate in Canada, because they did not trust the Canadians to form their candidates properly in the true Redemptorist spirit which could be had, they believed, only in Europe. Besides, they asked, since the professed novices would have to go to Belgium for their theological training, and the ordained priests would have to work elsewhere than in Canada because the Canadian parish mission field was so small, why bother with a novitiate in Canada?<sup>39</sup> English Canadian vocations from the three American parishes and from St. Ann, Montreal continued to trickle to the American provinces. Not until 1898 would a Canadian, Alphonse Lemieux, become Vice-provincial; at that point, the French Canadian Redemptorists began a novitiate, multiplied their missions and increased their vocations<sup>40</sup>. By that time it was too late; the Americans had decided to stay.

Along with the realization that Canada was a contest between the American and European models of Redemptorist life, a growing sense of continental 'manifest destiny' on the part of all Americans also accounts for the American Redemptorists' refusal to leave Canada. Americans, English Canadians, and even many of the Belgians believed that Canada was destined to become an English-speaking country. As the French Canadians assimilated and disappeared, so the thinking went, the future of the Congregation in Canada lay with the English Catholics. From the Americans' viewpoint, Canada naturally belonged to a North America dominated by the United States<sup>41</sup>.

---

<sup>39</sup> AGR Belgium (Vice-provincia Canadensis) 1899 September 16, joint letter by Visitor Lemieux and his consultors Strubbe and Savard to Raus requesting a novitiate: about ten English speakers have gone to the St. Louis Province for lack of a Canadian novitiate; AGR Belgium (Provincialia) 1899 October 14, Van Aertselaer to Raus grudgingly allowing a novitiate in order to stimulate and keep vocations in Canada instead of sending them to St. Louis, acknowledges the Vice-province's contention that Belgians «who left much to be desired» were sent to Canada and that this may have hindered vocations.

<sup>40</sup> Requests for a Canadian superior came from several Canadians, such as are found in AGR Belgium (Vice-provincia Canadensis) 1897 March 11, P[ierre] Pampalon to Raus; for money leaving Canada, AGR Belgium, «Status realis aerarii communis Vice-Provinciae Canadensis die 31 Dec. 1897».

<sup>41</sup> AGR Belgium (Provincialia) 1888 November 3, Kockerols to Mauron, «Reste à voir si les conditions du Canada resteront toujours les mêmes. Les Etats-Unis semblent toujours en convoiter l'annexion». AGR Belgium (Vice-provincia Canadensis) 1885 March 11, Catulle to Kockerols about French Canadian assimilation; AGR Belgium (Provincialia) 1897 April 16, Van Aertselaer to Raus; 1897 April 24, Vermeiren to Van Aertselaer; the Vice-Province of Canada still had too few men to accept the proposed foundation in Green Bay, Wisconsin.

The American refusal to give up St. Patrick's parish in Quebec City brought the Vice-province of Canada to consider accepting a French parish in Quebec City, but the possible problems of having two Redemptorist houses close to each other, causing comparisons, convinced the Belgians to look elsewhere. Eventually they purchased the Carmelite nuns' monastery, Our Lady of the Sacred Heart, in Hochelaga, in the east end of Montreal. Close to the Port of Montreal, composed of the poor and working class, it was a French Canadian equivalent of St. Ann's parish in the western part of the city<sup>42</sup>.

Hochelaga became the first foundation duplicating the European model of a Redemptorist mission house without a parish attached. Several of the men at St. Ann, Montreal were transferred to Hochelaga<sup>43</sup>. Although St. Anne-de-Beaupré had been partly built along the model of Clement Hofbauer's perpetual mission in St. Benno's Church, Warsaw, Hochelaga became the only truly European-style Redemptorist monastery in North America. Supposedly embodying the ideals of Redemptorist community life as lived in Belgium and Naples, it became the Vice-provincial novitiate. The European-style monastery, however, soon embroiled itself in jurisdictional disputes with the surrounding territorial parishes and, to solve the problem, petitioned to become a territorial English or French parish as early as 1897. The European authorities refused, insisting on the European missionary house model<sup>44</sup>. The mission house monastery chapel nevertheless later became the nucleus of a new French parish under secular priests, the parish of Très-Saint-Rédempteur established in 1913, while the

---

<sup>42</sup> For these negotiations, see RANBP (Montreal) 1895 August 19, Vicar General of Quebec, [Cyrille-Alfred] Marois to Catulle; AGR Belgium (Provincialia) 1895 September 21, Catulle to Van Aeryselaer; 1895 October 18, Raus to Van Aertselaer; for Baltimore's reaction, RABP 326 (Litz) 1895 October 23, Schwarz to Litz; 1895 November 26, Schwarz to Litz, and for acceptance of Hochelaga, ARPT (Pl.RR.PP. Provincialis et Visitoris permanentis. Documenta) 1895 December 2.

<sup>43</sup> Gérald LEBEL, C.Ss.R., «Marche historique» in «La Province Rédemptoriste de Sainte-Anne-de-Beaupré en marche, 1878-1967» (Sainte-Anne-de-Beaupré 1991) unpublished typescript 47-8; ASSELIN, 116-7; ARPT (Pl.RR.PP Provincialis et Visitoris permanentis. Documenta) 1895 December 2; Archives of the Roman Catholic Archdiocese of Montreal, File 465.106, 1895 November 12.

<sup>44</sup> AGR Belgium (Provincialia) 1897 November 22, Dubois to Van Aertselaer, with Raus appending a note; also (Vice provincia Canadensis) 1906 October 16, Consultor General Ernest Dubois to Provincial [Joseph Strybol] where he declares that Hochelaga may become an English territorial parish to avoid the conflicts of the many French parishes in the area. Unfortunately, the Vice-province had too few English Canadians.

mission house was eventually demolished, demonstrating yet again the importance of parishes in North American life.

#### THE CREATION OF THE VICE-PROVINCE OF TORONTO, 1898

The new Father General Matthias Raus ordered an official visit of North America to examine the American parish foundations, to end the continuing conflicts on the mission field, and to find solutions to the Belgian inability to attract English Canadian vocations and the Belgian inability to expand into English Canada. Father John Bennett, a former Provincial of the English Province who had been born in Newfoundland, accompanied the American Consultor General Joseph Schwarz on the visit<sup>45</sup>. Although he fell ill during the visitation and resigned without finishing, Bennett left notes condemning the Baltimore Province for bad administration, large debts and, above all, too many parishes which had caused the debts and the strain on the administration. Baltimore, he wrote, had abandoned Redemptorist tradition and had created Redemptorists who were not missionaries but parish priests. The parishes could be turned over to the dioceses and the houses closed. Other houses could be taken from Baltimore to form another Redemptorist province<sup>46</sup>.

When Bennett resigned, Raus named Father Daniel Mullane of the St. Louis Province to accompany Schwarz on the rest of the visitation. Mullane had been mentioned as a candidate for St. Louis provincial as early as 1894. By having Schwarz work with Mullane, a final decision could be made. Armed with Bennett's notes, the visitors rapidly, some said superficially, completed the visitation<sup>47</sup>. Together they discussed the possibility of carving a section of the huge Baltimore Province into a semi-independent vice-

---

<sup>45</sup> Archives of the Redemptorist Province of London, personnel file "John Bennett" born 1852 February 16 in St. John's, Newfoundland, professed 1872 at Bishop Eton, Liverpool, ordained 1877, had been rector in Perth, Scotland, before being named Provincial 1890-4. On his return to England, he was again named Provincial 1898-1904 and 1921-24. He died in 1938.

<sup>46</sup> AGR Baltimore (Visitatione) 1897 March 9, John Magnier's Latin translation of Bennett's English notes (Bennett's note could not be found for this study), «Depricat etiam divisionem factam inter missionarios et Patres, qui sunt quasi Parochi. Haec divisio est nova, contra traditiones nostras».

<sup>47</sup> AGR Baltimore (Visitatione) 1897 March 20; Redemptorist Archives of the St. Louis Province [ARPSL], Section: (Provincial), document: «Report of St. Louis Province by V. Rev. Ferreol Girardey, C.Ss.R., to Roma 1894», copy; (Provincial) 1897 August 27, Girardey to Magnier, copy.

province. Significantly, neither American raised the issue of closing any houses.

Daniel Mullane, who had worked in the Great Lakes region, suggested that the three American houses in Canada be joined to the United States foundations near the Great Lakes which all had mixed populations of French Canadians, Irish, and German immigrants, to form a Great Lakes Vice-province. St. Louis held Grand Rapids and Detroit in the state of Michigan while Baltimore held Rochester and Buffalo in New York State near Canada. Logically, the proposal had merit. The American houses were relatively close together and had been sending missionaries into Canada and attracting Canadian-born novices<sup>48</sup>. The Great Lakes formed a geographic unit separate from the other houses in the United States. While Baltimore had sent missionaries into eastern Canada, since 1887 St. Louis had sent men into Canada's western regions, especially British Columbia, from its house in St. Louis, Missouri. Eastern Canadian trains did not reach British Columbia's west coast until 1886 and, geographically, mountainous British Columbia was more closely united to its United States neighbours<sup>49</sup>. The North-South continental pull was such that Rome's Propaganda Fide, under which mission territories were administered, planned to have one of the western American Redemptorists named to the See of Vancouver Island<sup>50</sup>. The Redemptorist superi-

---

<sup>48</sup> AGR Baltimore (Visitatione) 1897 September 2, Mullane to Raus; Mullane's biography is available in ARPSL [John FLYNN, C.Ss.R.], *Necrology of the St. Louis Province. August 20, 1878 to September 15, 1935* (Volume I) chapter 59; For a description of the mixed population in Detroit, see RABP 591.2a (Detroit, Holy Redeemer) «1900 - Most Holy Redeemer ...»; PETER GEIERMANN, C.Ss.R., *Annals of the St. Louis Province of the Congregation of the Most Holy Redeemer* 3 volumes (Chicago 1924) II: 17.

<sup>49</sup> GEIERMANN statistics for 1887 show a Forty Hours Devotion at the Cathedral in Vancouver, B.C., a mission in the cathedral of Victoria, B.C.; a retreat to the clergy of Vancouver and another to the Sisters of Providence in Vancouver. The year 1890 saw retreats to students at Sandwich, St. Joseph's, London, and to the Young Ladies Academy of Windsor; 1900 a joint mission with the Canadian Vice-province in St. Mary's, Winnipeg, and in Rat Portage (Kenora), Ontario; 1901 a mission in the Vancouver cathedral. Kansas City also sent missionaries to New Westminster, B.C., in 1899 and gave three retreats in B.C. in 1900. The Seattle Sacred Heart Convent gave a mission in 1897 in New Westminster, B.C.; RABP 245 (Chronica Provincialia) «Provincia Baltimorensis anno 1897 Pars II» for sisters' retreats in 1898 in Victoria and in Vancouver.

<sup>50</sup> ARPSL (Provincial) 1897 November 26 Girardey to Magnier, copy; RABP 326 (Litz) 1897 December 11, Magnier to Litz, enclosing letter from the Apostolic Delegate of the United States to Girardey about the Rector of Seattle, Joseph Kautz, for the vacant see of Vancouver; on grounds of his poor health, Schwarz and Litz were able to ward off such an honour which would take one of their best missionaries; see 1898 January 8, Schwarz to Litz. AGR Baltimore (Provincialia) 1898 January 16, Litz to Raus.

ors saw that the Baltimore Province already covered eight dioceses in the United States, St. Louis held ten, while Canada had twelve<sup>51</sup>. Geographically, Canada should have had a separate province.

Other less geographic and more Redemptorist considerations supported a Great Lakes Vice-province. The Provincial of St. Louis, Ferreol Girardey, agreed readily to the proposal. By giving two houses to a Baltimore controlled vice-province, St. Louis could take its own men to fill other western houses, such as Seattle, Washington, which Baltimore had founded in the Far West in St. Louis' territory. Both Detroit and Grand Rapids were in debt, while Grand Rapids, with six men, no church, and close to Detroit, was the smallest house in the St. Louis Province and had been threatened repeatedly with suppression<sup>52</sup>. Girardey assured Father General that the debts on Detroit and Grand Rapids were small and that both foundations were financially healthy and would help establish the new vice-province. When Daniel Mullane learned that the small debt in Detroit was offset by great revenues and that Detroit was the most fruitful in vocations of the entire Province, he begged Schwarz to leave Detroit in the St. Louis Province. Grand Rapids, however, was further in St. Louis' territory than Detroit and it was illogical to give Grand Rapids to the Vice-province without giving Detroit which was on the international border between the United States and Canada<sup>53</sup>.

International political reasons also came into play. Joseph Schwarz noted that the large American provinces were under-represented in the Congregation. This had come about with the continual subdivisions of the European provinces and was about to get worse. While Father Bennett had been sent to North America to bring it into line with European standards, the American Consultor General Joseph Schwarz had just finished visiting England to recommend that the conflicts between the English and

---

<sup>51</sup> RABP 327 (Luecking) memorandum, n.a., n.d.

<sup>52</sup> AGR St Louis (Status Reales) «Domus - Grand Rapids. March 1897»; «Domus - Detroit 1897»; see AGR Baltimore (Provincialia) 1898 December 15, for Grand Rapids Redemptorists' attempt to raise money for a church by means of a chain letter; ARPSL file Grand Rapids, contains several letters about St. Louis' attempts to close the Grand Rapids house; see draft letter 1896 February 10, Girardey to Bishop Henry Richter of Grand Rapids requesting permission to close Grand Rapids and Bishop Richter's 1896 February 18 request for delay.

<sup>53</sup> ARPSL (Provincial) 1898 January 15, Girardey to Raus; ARPSL (Provincial) [Mullane] 1898 January 11.

the Irish be solved by dividing them into separate provinces. Ireland, if it were divided from England and established as a separate province with only two houses, would have as many representatives at the next chapter as Baltimore with twenty-four houses<sup>54</sup>. Dividing Baltimore would give the Americans greater representation in Rome to counter the European criticisms of the parish foundations in North America. Father Raus received letters from other Redemptorists, notably Cyril Dodsworth working in Toronto, urging a division in the Baltimore Province, because the Province was becoming too large for any one man to administer. When Provincial Litz spoke of his doubts about the division, Schwarz merely reported to Litz how much criticism there had been of the over-large Baltimore Province<sup>55</sup>.

In summary, the geographic, administrative, and political reasons for the establishment of the Great Lakes Vice-province overruled any objections. St. Louis Provincial Ferreol Girardey agreed that the plan was good for St. Louis and the Congregation in North America. His procurator Daniel Mullane, as the financial manager of the St. Louis Province, originally wanted to lighten the debt load by getting rid of Detroit and Grand Rapids. The Baltimore Provincial and the American Consultor General wanted to protect the American Redemptorist parish system and counter any Belgian criticism or expansion. If the Vice-province of Canada thought of expanding its European system into western Canada, it would find the new American Great Lakes Vice-province blocking its path. The missions were hard and the Canadian parishes were small, but Americans who had outlived their usefulness or their welcome in the United States, could still be sent to Canada<sup>56</sup>.

After the visitation, Schwarz secretly proposed a vice-province for all of the Canadian houses, both American and Belgian, as did the Canadian Vice-provincial Jean Catulle. While Catulle suggested a Belgian Vice-province, Schwarz asked Father General that all of the houses be given to Baltimore. He gave several reasons. They could all be summarized in the statement that the

---

<sup>54</sup> RABP 326 (Litz) 1894 October 31, Schwarz to Litz; also SHARP, 47-59.

<sup>55</sup> AGR Baltimore (Personalia) 1897 October 30, Dodsworth to [Magnier]; (Provincial) 1898 January 13, Litz to Schwarz, that not only had he properly administered the entire Baltimore Province, but when he arrived, the Province was in debt and now showed a surplus.

<sup>56</sup> CURLEY, *The Provincial Story*, 144; also see individual personnel files of deceased American Redemptorists.

Americans refused to give up all of the Canadian houses. The English houses, such as St. Patrick's house in Quebec City, were necessary for the growing number of English Americans. Since the Belgians did not have enough English Canadian priests to take over the parish foundations, Schwarz objected to houses with American subjects and Belgian or French Canadian superiors with their different ideas about living the Redemptorist Rule. To the Provincial of Baltimore, Schwarz also admitted that he refused to have the Belgians expand into what was formerly American and his jurisdiction<sup>57</sup>.

Schwarz's last-minute plan for a Baltimore Vice-province of Canada including the French houses was rejected. If the Americans did not want to join the Belgian Vice-province of Canada, the French Canadians and the Belgians in Canada did not want to join the Baltimore Province. So Father Raus accepted Mullane's original Great Lakes plan in its entirety on April 1, 1898. He created a Great Lakes Vice-province consisting of American houses on both sides of the border and from the St. Louis and Baltimore Provinces. Toronto, Quebec City, and Saint John in Canada were lumped with St. Joseph in Rochester, Immaculate Conception in Buffalo, Holy Redeemer in Detroit and St. Alphonsus in Grand Rapids. John Loewekamp, who had been touted as the next Baltimore Provincial, became Vice-provincial and reported that the Americans in Canada were happy with the changes<sup>58</sup>. In fact, the Baltimore Province was bled of good men, missionaries and administrators, and the English Canadian houses were staffed with younger, usually more active men<sup>59</sup>. With headquar-

---

<sup>57</sup> AGR Baltimore (Visitatione) 1897 June 26, Schwarz to Fr. Visitor [Loewekamp], «When once the smoke of battle has cleared away, I believe all will begin to see that all has been done for the best - and has been really for the better. I knew very well that my plans & suggestions would rouse opposition but that is always the case and opposition would only make me the more determined to do what after long & serious reflection & prayer I believed right. ... all this talk about this absorption [sic] of the American houses by the Belgians is *absolutely false*... One of the very reasons why a Vice Province was started was to prevent the Belgians from *absorbing our houses & fathers* in Canada».

<sup>58</sup> AGR Baltimore (Provincialia) 1898 May 18, Loewekamp to Schwarz, «[E]verything is running along so regularly and smoothly in the Vice-Province ... Your words 'After a while all will be satisfied and see that all has been done for the better' are fulfilling themselves».

<sup>59</sup> RABP 327 (Luecking) Diary entry. n.d.; consultors were F.X. Miller and Peter Ward; Albert Stern was rector in Buffalo, Ward rector in Toronto, Philip Rossbach in Rochester, Joseph Henning in Quebec, Michael Corduke in Saint John, Francis Klauer in Detroit, and Patrick Barrett in Grand Rapids. They had all worked in Canada before.

ters in St. Patrick, Toronto, the new Great Lakes Vice-province was to be called the Toronto Vice-province. Mullane was named Provincial of St. Louis; a new Provincial with little prior administrative experience, William Luecking, was named to Baltimore. He thanked Father Schwarz for making the administrative load so much lighter by creating the Vice-province. The French Canadian Alphonse Lemieux was named Vice-provincial of Canada and he began the novitiate in Hochelaga. These changes, along with many others in the Congregation around the world, reorganized the Congregation for the twentieth century. The Toronto chronicler became excited at the news and the honour<sup>60</sup>.

#### THE COLLAPSE OF THE VICE-PROVINCE OF TORONTO

While Schwarz confidently predicted that the Vice-province would be for the best and everyone, even St. Louis which had lost Detroit, would get used to it, the new Provincial of Baltimore quickly developed doubts and privately predicted that the new Vice-province would not last long<sup>61</sup>. Both Litz, the former Provincial, and Luecking, the new Provincial, confided in Schauer that everything was a mystery and a mess<sup>62</sup>. Mullane continued to beg Schwarz to keep Detroit in the St. Louis Province. Although there had been almost complete unanimity before its creation, the new Toronto Vice-province appeared in a different context than the one that created it. The new political context was definitely opposed to the new Vice-province.

---

<sup>60</sup> AGR Baltimore (Provincialia) 1898 April 18, Luecking to Schwarz; ARPT Annals of St. Patrick's, Toronto, 1898 April 25.

<sup>61</sup> RABP 327 (Luecking) Diary, «The creation of a vice-province is not favorably received by many. That Detroit & Grand Rapids should be detached from West & put to Vice-province is regarded by some as a subterfuge to supply Fathers to west - & optimism says they will be returned»; see also 1898 June 2, Luecking to Dusold, «It is said that the West is very much worked up over the spoliation of Detroit. Well, I hope they will take 'em back & give us back our vice-province».

<sup>62</sup> RABP 327 (Luecking) 1898 April 20, Luecking to Schauer, «... you are consultor at Buffalo. Will you kindly remain at Ilchester until further notice in order to save what remains of the wreck»; RABP 326 (Litz) 1898 April 18, Litz to Schauer, «I dare not say what I think - this whole last year has been a mystery to me»; the new Provincial of Baltimore, Luecking, exclaimed in his private diary: «I expected surprise, but not such as I now learned»; Schwarz illustrates the growing power of the general consultors over Raus and the provincials: RABP 326 (Litz) 1898 April 19, Schwarz to Litz, stating he sacrificed Schauer and made changes in Litz's suggested nominations.

First came the new St. Louis Provincial Daniel Mullane. He regularly visited Detroit as if it were still part of the St. Louis Province, spreading news, rumours, and doubt about the permanency of the changes. He incited several St. Louis members to write directly to Schwarz to protest the changes<sup>63</sup>. Although Schwarz wrote Mullane personally in August of 1898 that no change would be made, Mullane refused to negotiate with Baltimore about the transfer of the property and convinced the new Baltimore Provincial that no peace could be had until Detroit was returned<sup>64</sup>. Finally, Father General Raus decided to reopen the question and in December asked whether and when the houses of Detroit and Grand Rapids should be returned to St. Louis. Schwarz wrote an accompanying letter asking that if the answer was in the affirmative then the transfer would be held at the end of the triennial appointments to avoid the appearance of a mistake or haste<sup>65</sup>. Immediately on receiving Father General's letter, the St. Louis Provincial convened his consultors and ordered them to write their answers that very day, naturally in the affirmative. One of them did not bother to state his reasons, saying only that Provincial Mullane had surely written all of the reasons out in full. Mullane had developed a particular *furor scribendi* or passion for writing letters, sometimes several to Schwarz in a single day<sup>66</sup>. Mullane's other consultor, Terence Clarke, wrote that Detroit was one of the best houses, as far as money and vocations to the Redemptorists, and its loss was a serious blow to the health of the St. Louis Province. Not content with asking for the return of the houses at the end of the triennium, he further argued that the houses be transferred immediately, because no American bishop or American Redemptorist wanted to be controlled from Canada.

More calmly, Vice-provincial John Loewekamp argued that since the Vice-province was created in order to reduce the burden

---

<sup>63</sup> ARPSL (Holy Redeemer Chronicles. Book II 1888-1909); also 1898 June 26, and August 29, Mullane to Schwarz; (Provincial) 1898 July 4, Mullane to Schwarz; 1898 July 18, Thomas Brown, C.Ss.R., to Schwarz; 1898 September 1, Mullane to Schwarz [copies].

<sup>64</sup> ARPSL (Provincial) 1898 October 9, Mullane to Schwarz; 1898 November 21, Mullane to Schwarz; 1898 November 24, Mullane to Schwarz; RABP 327 (Luecking) 1898 November 24, Luecking to Loewekamp; AGR Baltimore (Provincialia) 1898 November 21, Luecking to Schwarz; 1898 December 26, Luecking to Raus.

<sup>65</sup> ARPSL (Provincial) 1898 December 6, Raus to Luecking and others; RABP 327 (Luecking) 1898 December 7, Schwarz to Luecking, commenting on Raus' letter.

<sup>66</sup> ARPSL [copies] 1898 December 21, William Loewekamp to Raus, Mullane to Schwarz; again Mullane to Schwarz; Mullane to Raus; Terence Clarke to Schwarz [copies], originals in AGR Baltimore (Provincialia).

on the Baltimore Provincial, the western houses of Grand Rapids and Detroit should be given back to the St. Louis province, but as Schwarz had asked, after a complete triennium to reduce the appearance of failure. Loewekamp's consultors, Peter Ward and F.-X. Miller, gave fuller explanations. The Detroit and Grand Rapids houses were truly western houses closer to the St. Louis Province than to the Baltimore Province. They were English houses, not German as were the majority of the Baltimore houses. Furthermore, American bishops did not want Canadian control of American houses and Canadian bishops did not like American control of Canadian houses. So it was best to transfer the houses back, but not immediately, because it would leave an impression of haste among the bishops, priests, and people and would be an embarrassment to those, especially Schwarz, who had planned the Vice-province. Appearances must be maintained<sup>67</sup>.

The Vice-provincial of Canada was not asked his opinion. Nevertheless, the French Canadians were unhappy with the development of the Toronto Vice-province and declared that no Belgians or French Canadians should be allowed to join the Vice-Province of Toronto for fear that the Vice-province of Canada would be bled of bilingual or English speaking Redemptorists, the only hope for a geographically united Canadian Province. At the prodding of the French Canadians, the Belgian Provincial asked Father General whether the American Redemptorists would take the Danish West Indies off the Canadian Vice-province's hands, since the American government was trying to buy the islands. If so, the Canadians would gladly accept Saint John in New Brunswick and move to form a Canadian Province<sup>68</sup>.

The French Canadians wanted to expand into the rest of Canada. Jean Catulle had visited the Northwest in 1892 on the invitation of Albert Lacombe, O.M.I. Catulle then sent Guillaume Godts to give missions in German, French, Flemish and English.

---

<sup>67</sup> AGR Baltimore (Provincialia) 1898 December 28, Loewekamp to Raus; copy in RABP 327 (Luecking) AGR BALTIMORE (Provincialia) 1899 January 1, Miller to Raus; 1899 January 1, Ward to Raus.

<sup>68</sup> AGR Belgium (Provincialia) 1899 April 22, Provincial Van Aertselaer to Raus; (Vice-provincia Canadensis) 1900 February 16, Lemieux, Strubbe, and Savard to Van Aertselaer; (Provincialia) 1900 February 4, Van Aertselaer to Raus, suggesting that Arthur Caron or Cyril Dodsworth, both working in Canada, would make excellent bishops for Roseau; 1900 November 30; (Vice-provincia Canadensis) 1900 July 31, Lemieux to Consultor General [Dubois].

Godts encouraged Archbishop Taché to ask for a Redemptorist foundation, but the western bishop died. His successor, Adelard Langevin, after unsuccessfully asking for help in 1896, visited Father General Raus in 1898 and obtained a promise of help<sup>69</sup>. The Belgians agreed that the Canadians had to move into the Canadian Northwest in order to expand their missions and avoid being hemmed in or absorbed by the parish-based American Vice-province of Toronto. Now that the American houses were part of the Toronto Vice-province and out of the Canadian Vice-province's reach, other means were needed to attract English and bilingual vocations. Believing that the Toronto Vice-province was merely a temporary organization to wean the American houses in Canada away from Baltimore prior to their joining the Belgian Vice-province of Canada, and still believing that the future of the Congregation lay with the European-style mission houses favoured by the Belgians, Raus opened the western Canadian field to the Vice-province of Canada<sup>70</sup>. The Vice-province of Canada established a house on August 15, 1898 in the mainly English parish of St. Augustine of Canterbury in Brandon, Manitoba. Alphonse Lemieux launched the drive to a bilingual Canadian Province and decreed that the language of the Redemptorist house in Brandon would be

---

<sup>69</sup> ARPT (Brandon Annals) Godts preached in German near Regina and in Flemish near Edmonton. In 1893 he gave retreats to the Grey Nuns in St. Albert and an eight-day mission at Immaculate Conception, Winnipeg; see AGR Belgium (Vice-provincia Canadensis) 1892 July 2, Catulle to Mauron re Northwest Territories; Provincial (Civil) Archives of Alberta [PAA], containing the Archives of the Redemptorist Province of Edmonton, 79.187 R78/1 (Correspondence ... Brandon) 1895 August 1, Xerox copy from Winnipeg archives, Godts to «Monseigneur», suggesting that the Redemptorists be requested to care for the immigrants in the west and that Belgians speaking English, French, German, and other languages would be best; for Langevin's previous offer, see AGR Belgium (Vice-provincia Canadensis) 1896 June 6, Langevin to Raus, re Brandon, Manitoba with twenty-three English families and Regina, Saskatchewan with twenty-five German families and some others with stations in Moose Jaw and Willowbunch; RANBP (Montreal) 1896 August 7, Langevin to Van Aertselaer asking for Belgians based on their success in the Belgian school controversies; AGR Belgium (Vice-provincia Canadensis) 1896 November 11, Langevin to Raus.

<sup>70</sup> AGR Belgium (Provincia) 1898 May 24, Van Aertselaer to Raus, «... le P. Catulle ... ajoute que après la formation de la vice province Torontine, il n'y a plus que ce moyen (l'entrée au Manitoba) d'étendre la vice province Canadienne. Les canadiens en seront très satisfaits et cesseront de craindre comme ils le font maintenant d'être absorbés par la vice province Torontine et de devoir former une seule province avec celle-ci»; 1898 May 31, Raus to Van Aertselaer, «De côté, la Vice-Province du Canada trouvera un vaste champ pour se développer peu-à-peu, en travaillant aussi au salut de populations plus nécessiteuses où le ministère exige plus de sacrifices».

English<sup>71</sup>. Within a short time, the Redemptorists organized the parish and Godts embarked on an ambitious building programme<sup>72</sup>. Significantly, the French Canadian Lemieux had adopted the American model of parish houses.

With the rumours set in motion by Daniel Mullane, with the expansion of the Canadian Vice-province defeating one of the purposes of the Toronto Vice-province, and with the comings and goings of the Vice-provincial and his consultants, the Toronto chronicler could merely state that «Curiosity is on tip-toe»<sup>73</sup>. The uncertainty of the Vice-province's continuing existence brought the Baltimore and Toronto major superiors to stop all building projects. Underlying the restraint was the suspicion that Baltimore money might go to buildings which would soon belong to St. Louis or to the French Canadian Vice-province<sup>74</sup>. The best the young Americans in Canada could do was organize the parish societies, such as the St. Peter's Young Men's Association, which launched

---

<sup>71</sup> RANBP (Montreal) 1896 May 14, Catulle to Van Aertselaer; for an account of the foundation, see ARPT 727-01 and 02; the Redemptorist foundation was established on August 15, 1898, but the parish had been established in 1893 shortly after the Canadian Pacific Railway passed through the town. Brandon comprised the town and outmissions to Souris, Monteith, Fairfax, and Caroll to the south, Rapid city, Minnedosa and Clan William to the North, Alexander to the west, Carberry, Melbourne, Douglas, and Hun's Valley to the east; see RANBP (Acta Provincium, Conventiones et decreta) agreement of 1898 July 16, Adelard Archbishop Langevin of St. Boniface and Jean Catulle, to take over debts, land, and buildings of the Faithful Companions of Jesus in Brandon, Manitoba for \$2500; also AGR Belgium (Vice-provincia Canadensis) 1898 July 19, agreement between Van Aertselaer and Langevin, including codicils; ARPT 211, 1898 December 2, Lemieux to [Godts], «P.S. Pour les Actes communs, il me semble que Brandon est et sera une maison anglaise. Donc ...».

<sup>72</sup> RANBP (Brandon) shows the organization of «The Brandon Catholic Club. Organized Dec. 1901», ms., for Catholic men over eighteen; the Brandon community published *The Catholic Annual* between 1899 and 1910, almanac of advertisements, Catholic information, calendars, short articles, and jokes, and useful for the history of the Brandon foundation. All the Brandon Redemptorists worked on the *Annual*; ARPT (Brandon Annals) 1899 April 23, Feast of St. Joseph sees the installation of the picture of Our Lady of Perpetual Help and the inauguration of the Archconfraternity; 1899 August 22, the arrival of a Sister of Charity of Gand to teach school; See also PAA 79.187 R78/1 (Correspondence ... Brandon) [1899?] April 18, Godts to Langevin; AGR Belgium, Provincialia, 1902 May 16, Strybol to Raus.

<sup>73</sup> ARPT (Annals of St. Patrick's, Toronto) 1898 November 21, and 1900 March 7.

<sup>74</sup> AGR Baltimore (Provincialia) 1898 September 24, J.H. [Loewekamp] to Schwarz, for the ban on building; 1898 December 28, A. Frank, C.Ss.R., Baltimore consultant secretary, to Raus, stating that Baltimore is working for another province; RABP 329 (Schneider) 1912 November 24, Fidelis Speidel, Consultant General to Provincial Schneider, «But I know Fr. Lucking has made a mistake in regard to the first Vice-Prov. of Toronto - wishing to rule it all himself and making the Vice-Provincial with his Consulta a mere figure-head».

semi-professional sports and theatre among the Catholic population of Saint John, New Brunswick<sup>75</sup>.

Schwarz complained of St. Louis Provincial Mullane's haste to regain Detroit, but by the beginning of 1899, a mere seven months after the creation of the Toronto Vice-province, Schwarz bowed to the pressures successfully stage-managed by Daniel Mullane. Schwarz informed Vice-provincial John Loewekamp that at the next triennial appointments in 1901, Grand Rapids and Detroit would be given back to the St. Louis Province. Daniel Mullane immediately visited Detroit and Grand Rapids dropping broader hints about the imminent transfer and effectively stopped any other activities by the Baltimore men. The Toronto Vice-province was paralyzed with three major superiors - Loewekamp, Luecking, and Mullane. Mullane meanwhile began plans to expand the St. Louis Province further west and to establish a Rocky Mountain Vice-province<sup>76</sup>.

Whether the American houses in Canada would ever be given to the Vice-province of Canada, however, was another matter. Although the Quebec parishioners might revolt at French speaking priests, Schwarz thought that did not matter. More important was whether the Baltimore Province would have enough purely English language houses for its own men, many of whom more and more spoke only English<sup>77</sup>. Second generation Irish and German Catholic Americans who barely knew any German had begun to overwhelm the German nature of the American Redemptorists. Provincial Luecking of Baltimore had once suggested that the transfer of his Canadian houses to the Vice-province of Canada might be a logical solution to the Baltimore administration problems, but he rapidly learned that what was logical was impossible<sup>78</sup>. His consultors

---

<sup>75</sup> ARPT 504-10 *Souvenir of the Dual Anniversary of Saint Aloysius Society 1873-1898, Saint Peter's Young Men's Association 1898-1923* (Saint Peter's, Saint John, New Brunswick, August 1923) Which contains John G. BURKE, «*The Silver and The Golden, St. Peter's Y.M.A.*», 11-18, and E. Ray HANSEN, «*Athletic Endeavors Essential. Synopsis of Sport in the Y.M.A.*», 19-25; ARPT (St. Peter's local archives) «*Annals of St. Peter's Young Men's Association (Y.M.A.) 1898-1912.*

<sup>76</sup> RABP 327 (Luecking) 1900 September 28, Luecking to Loewekamp; 1899 January 18, Schwarz to Loewekamp; ARPSL (Provincial) 1899 March 16, Mullane to Schwarz about the Rocky Mountain Vice-province; 1899 April 29 and July 15, Mullane to Schwarz about visits and rumours in Detroit and Grand Rapids.

<sup>77</sup> RABP 327 (Luecking) 1900 January 26, Schwarz to Loewekamp, Luecking, and Mullane.

<sup>78</sup> AGR Baltimore (Provincialia) 1898 September 16, Luecking to Schwarz, p. 5, «*The American Fathers in Canada, of course, would all like to be in the States; and on the other hand the Canadian Bishops want Canadian priests in Canada. ... If there could be a purely*

refused to give up the houses. Loewekamp, his own Vice-provincial, reminded Schwarz that he was in Rome to protect American, not Canadian interests. At best, one consultor was willing to trade Saint John, New Brunswick, an almost German house, for the Belgian English language house of St. Ann, Montreal. St. Ann was closer to the Toronto Vice-province while Saint John, it was thought, might become a center for the French Acadian missions in the Maritimes. This overlooked the fact that Saint John was in the most Protestant and English section of New Brunswick, while the Acadians lived further to the north<sup>79</sup>. Vice-provincial Loewekamp also argued strongly that at least Toronto «the most Americanized city in Canada» and maybe Quebec be left to the Baltimore Province. Both were so close to the United States as to be considered in the States. Bowing to pressures within the American Redemptorist community, Provincial Luecking changed his mind and refused to give up even Saint John, New Brunswick even if another house were offered, say, in the West Indies. The Americans thought Canada much more like the United States than the West Indies could ever be<sup>80</sup>.

American correspondence from 1898 to 1900 also showed a growing distrust of the French Canadians. Every time the French Canadians asked the Americans to take over the West Indies, every time the French Canadians asked for permission to give a French mission in the United States, Luecking and Mullane fought against any division of American authority, against any help for the French Canadians, and against the possibility that Canada

---

Canadian province [with] Canadian priests, it would perhaps be the best solution of the difficulties»; RABP 327 (Luecking) 1899 October 18, Luecking to Loewekamp, «Will you kindly let me know whether any hints were given you about a Canadian Province? ... It would be advisable however that we have an interview about this matter, so as to promote our common interests by concerted action. If a Canadian Province should be formed, I suppose it would mean the loss to us of the three Candian houses under your jurisdiction».

<sup>79</sup> RABP 327 (Luecking) c. 1899, Joseph Henning [?] memorandum. «Reasons why the Houses of the Balt. Province in Canada should not be annexed to the Canadian Province».

<sup>80</sup> AGR Baltimore (Provincialia) 1898 December 19, Loewekamp to Schwarz; 1899 October 13, Luecking to Schwarz, 4-6; 1899 December 19, Loewekamp to [Schwarz]; 1900 February 21, Luecking to Schwarz and 1900 April 4, Luecking to Schwarz, in both of which he protests the Baltimore Provinces receiving the West Indies from the Canadian Vice-province in exchange for the English Canadian houses; Luecking repeated his belief that the Vice-province could contain only the three Canadian houses in 1901 February 8, Luecking to Raus.

would be lost to the Americans<sup>81</sup>. Were the American Redemptorists being swept away in the current of American Manifest Destiny? The Spanish-American War had just ended in Spain's utter defeat and gave Puerto Rico, Guam, the Philippines and some control over Cuba to the United States, effectively establishing it as a new world power.

Just after the Spanish American War, by the beginning of 1899, the Belgians had volunteered for the Congo missions and many Belgians who would have gone to help in the expansion of the Vice-province of Canada and some already in Canada were sent to the Congo<sup>82</sup>. The Vice-province of Canada could no longer take over the English Canadian Redemptorist parishes of Toronto, Saint John, and Quebec City with Flemish Belgians. Once the American parishes were no longer threatened by Belgian and French Canadian expansion and the Belgians had moved their missionary fervour from North America into the Congo, yet another reason for an American Vice-province in Canada disappeared.

The triennial appointments came in May of 1901. Not only were the Detroit and St. Louis houses returned to St. Louis, but the Vice-province itself disappeared and the original status quo returned. When he heard that the Vice-province was suppressed, Elias Schauer and many others gave thanks to God<sup>83</sup>. It had been three years of bewildering rumours, tensions, closed door negotiations, and half-understood competition paralyzing all inter-provincial cooperation on the missions and in the parishes of Canada.

---

<sup>81</sup> RABP 327 (Luecking) 1900 March 29, Luecking to Loewekamp, «The whole scheme of these men is to get rid of the West Indies, in order to overrun Canada. ... The Irish in Quebec would certainly regret the day these men came. I shall, therefore, continue to agitate day after day against parting with any of these Canadian houses, just in order to oppose the schemes of these Canadians who want to make us victims to further their own ends»; see also ARPT 210, 1901 September 10, Mullane to Lemieux.

<sup>82</sup> Presently Zaire; ARPT (Pl.RR.PP. Provincialis et Visitatoris permanentis. Documenta) 1899 January 6.

<sup>83</sup> RABP «Annals Buffalo 1888-1899» Schauer was the chronicler, «May 18 [1901] Positive news has reached us today that the new triennial appointments of Superiors from Rome have been announced and that the Vice-province of Toronto is dropped for good. Deo Gratias»; Buffalo had been considered a German house and the annals were kept in German before joining the Vice-province and Schauer switched back to German after the Vice-province collapsed; the Rochester chronicler did not bother to note the collapse; the Toronto chronicler welcomed the news on May 18, 1901 in Gaelic: «Slaupt gy well!».

## CONCLUSION

The 1898 Vice-province of Toronto was formed primarily to alleviate the heavy administrative burden on the Baltimore Provincial. Secondly, it was meant to keep Canada in the control of the Americans. Thirdly, it was meant to keep the Vice-province of Canada from expanding into English Canada and into the Franco-American mission field. Lastly, and more importantly, it was an attempt by the American Redemptorists to show the Europeans in general and the Belgians in particular the strength and the success of the North American Redemptorist experience in parishes and with vocations.

The Vice-province of Toronto failed foremost because the St. Louis Province, under Provincial Mullane, refused to allow its two houses to become part of the Baltimore Province and acted as if the houses still belonged to the St. Louis Province. The Vice-province of Toronto might have survived the removal of Detroit and Grand Rapids, but the Baltimore Province helped to dismantle the rest of the Vice-province by refusing the Vice-provincial sufficient funds or permissions to build for fear that money given to it would only go to St. Louis or to the French Canadians in the end. In spite of criticisms of the large Baltimore Province, the new Provincial and his consultors believed themselves capable of handling the entire Province, including Canada, and resented any division of authority. Roman approval for the Brandon house removed one of the main reasons for a separate Vice-province, to keep the Belgian Vice-province of Canada from moving into western Canada. Then the Belgian withdrawal from Canada for the Congo removed the Americans' fears about European influence in North America. The Vice-province of Toronto was a logical solution planned at length by Provincials and Consultors for several administrative and geographical problems. Competing imperialisms, in the Baltimore, the St. Louis, and the Belgian Provinces, created and then destroyed the Vice-province of Toronto.

The American houses returned to quiet regular order and the English Canadians in the Belgian Vice-province of Canada prepared for the home missions. The Americans launched missions in Porto Rico and encouraged everyone, even their English Canadians, to study Spanish for the American Redemptorists' first foreign mission. Canada, of course, was never considered entirely

foreign territory by American Redemptorists<sup>84</sup>. The Americans approved a new club house for the young men on St. Peter's property in Saint John, bought a new Casavant organ, and built a new church for St. Patrick's, Toronto; the Belgians sent the English Canadians Scanlan, McPhail, and Holland to second novitiate in St. Ann's, Montreal to study mission techniques. Meanwhile, Consultor General Schwarz continued to argue that an English Canadian Vice-province should be established for the good of English Canada.

---

<sup>84</sup> ARPT «Provincialia» [Scrapbook of letters from the Baltimore Provincial sent to St. Patrick's, Quebec City, 1880-1914] 1902 November 1, circular; George Mylett, born 1877 October 31, and raised in St. Patrick, Quebec City, professed 1897, ordained 1902, was sent to Porto Rico in 1904. CURLEY, *The Provincial Story*, 256 «[Luecking] also promoted ... the initiation of the Baltimore Province into the foreign mission field».